# Study Guide: Truncation Error Analysis 

$$
\text { Hans Petter Langtangen }{ }^{1,2}
$$

Center for Biomedical Computing, Simula Research Laboratory ${ }^{1}$
Department of Informatics, University of Oslo ${ }^{2}$
Dec 12, 2013

## Overview of what truncation errors are

- Definition: The truncation error is the discrepancy that arises from performing a finite number of steps to approximate a process with infinitely many steps.
- Widely used: truncation of infinite series, finite precision arithmetic, finite differences, and differential equations.
- Why? The truncation error is an error measure that is easy to compute.


## Abstract problem setting

Consider an abstract differential equation

$$
\mathcal{L}(u)=0 .
$$

Example: $\mathcal{L}(u)=u^{\prime}(t)+a(t) u(t)-b(t)$.
The corresponding discrete equation:

$$
\mathcal{L}_{\Delta}(u)=0 .
$$

Let now

- $u$ be the numerical solution of the discrete equations, computed at mesh points: $u^{n}, n=0, \ldots, N_{t}$
- $u_{\mathrm{e}}$ the exact solution of the differential equation

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathcal{L}\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}\right) & =0 \\
\mathcal{L}_{\Delta}(u) & =0
\end{aligned}
$$

$u$ is computed at mesh points

- Dream: the true error $e=u_{\mathrm{e}}-u$, but usually impossible
- Must find other error measures that are easier to calculate
- Derive formulas for $u$ in (very) special, simplified cases
- Compute empirical convergence rates for special choices of $u_{e}$ (usually non-physical $u_{e}$ )
- To what extent does $u_{\mathrm{e}}$ fulfill $\mathcal{L}_{\Delta}\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}\right)=0$ ?
- It does not fit, but we can measure the error $\mathcal{L}_{\Delta}\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}\right)=R$
- $R$ is the truncation error and it is easy to compute in general, without considering special cases

Truncation errors in finite difference formulas

## Example: The backward difference for $u^{\prime}(t)$

Backward difference approximation to $u^{\prime}$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t}^{-} u\right]^{n}=\frac{u^{n}-u^{n-1}}{\Delta t} \approx u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Define the truncation error of this approximation as

$$
\begin{equation*}
R^{n}=\left[D_{t}^{-} u\right]^{n}-u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) . \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

The common way of calculating $R^{n}$ is to
(1) expand $u(t)$ in a Taylor series around the point where the derivative is evaluated, here $t_{n}$,
(2) insert this Taylor series in (2), and
(3) collect terms that cancel and simplify the expression.

General Taylor series expansion from calculus:

$$
f(x+h)=\sum_{i=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{i!} \frac{d^{i} f}{d x^{i}}(x) h^{i} .
$$

Here: expand $u^{n-1}$ around $t_{n}$ :

$$
\begin{aligned}
u\left(t_{n-1}\right)=u(t-\Delta t) & =\sum_{i=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{i!} \frac{d^{i} u}{d t^{i}}\left(t_{n}\right)(-\Delta t)^{i} \\
& =u\left(t_{n}\right)-u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{3}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

- $\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{3}\right)$ : power-series in $\Delta t$ where the lowest power is $\Delta t^{3}$
- Small $\Delta t: \Delta t \gg \Delta t^{3} \gg \Delta t^{4}$

Taylor series inserted in the backward difference approximation

$$
\begin{aligned}
{\left[D_{t}^{-} u\right]^{n}-u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)=} & \frac{u\left(t_{n}\right)-u\left(t_{n-1}\right)}{\Delta t}-u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \\
= & \frac{u\left(t_{n}\right)-\left(u\left(t_{n}\right)-u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{3}\right)\right)}{\Delta t} \\
& -u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \\
= & \left.-\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Result:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left.R^{n}=-\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)\right) \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

The difference approximation is of first order in $\Delta t$. It is exact for linear $u_{\mathrm{e}}$.

Now consider a forward difference:

$$
u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \approx\left[D_{t}^{+} u\right]^{n}=\frac{u^{n+1}-u^{n}}{\Delta t}
$$

Define the truncation error:

$$
R^{n}=\left[D_{t}^{+} u\right]^{n}-u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) .
$$

Expand $u^{n+1}$ in a Taylor series around $t_{n}$,

$$
u\left(t_{n+1}\right)=u\left(t_{n}\right)+u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{3}\right)
$$

We get

$$
R=\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right) .
$$

For the central difference approximation,

$$
u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \approx\left[D_{t} u\right]^{n}, \quad\left[D_{t} u\right]^{n}=\frac{u^{n+\frac{1}{2}}-u^{n-\frac{1}{2}}}{\Delta t}
$$

the truncation error is

$$
R^{n}=\left[D_{t} u\right]^{n}-u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) .
$$

Expand $u\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)$ and $u\left(t_{n-1 / 2}\right)$ in Taylor series around the point $t_{n}$ where the derivative is evaluated:

$$
\begin{aligned}
u\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)= & u\left(t_{n}\right)+u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \frac{1}{2} \Delta t+\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\left(\frac{1}{2} \Delta t\right)^{2}+ \\
& \frac{1}{6} u^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\left(\frac{1}{2} \Delta t\right)^{3}+\frac{1}{24} u^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\left(\frac{1}{2} \Delta t\right)^{4}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{5}\right) \\
u\left(t_{n-1 / 2}\right)= & u\left(t_{n}\right)-u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \frac{1}{2} \Delta t+\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\left(\frac{1}{2} \Delta t\right)^{2}- \\
& \frac{1}{6} u^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\left(\frac{1}{2} \Delta t\right)^{3}+\frac{1}{24} u^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\left(\frac{1}{2} \Delta t\right)^{4}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{5}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

## The central difference for $u^{\prime}(t)(1)$

$$
u\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)-u\left(t_{n-1 / 2}\right)=u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\frac{1}{24} u^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{3}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{5}\right) .
$$

By collecting terms in $\left[D_{t} u\right]^{n}-u\left(t_{n}\right)$ we find $R^{n}$ to be

$$
\begin{equation*}
R^{n}=\frac{1}{24} u^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right), \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

Note:

- Second-order accuracy since the leading term is $\Delta t^{2}$
- Only even powers of $\Delta t$

$$
\begin{align*}
{\left[D_{t} u\right]^{n} } & =\frac{u^{n+\frac{1}{2}}-u^{n-\frac{1}{2}}}{\Delta t}=u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+R^{n}  \tag{5}\\
R^{n} & =\frac{1}{24} u^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)  \tag{6}\\
{\left[D_{2 t} u\right]^{n} } & =\frac{u^{n+1}-u^{n-1}}{2 \Delta t}=u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+R^{n},  \tag{7}\\
R^{n} & =\frac{1}{6} u^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)  \tag{8}\\
{\left[D_{t}^{-} u\right]^{n} } & =\frac{u^{n}-u^{n-1}}{\Delta t}=u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+R^{n},  \tag{9}\\
R^{n} & =-\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)  \tag{10}\\
{\left[D_{t}^{+} u\right]^{n} } & =\frac{u^{n+1}-u^{n}}{\Delta t}=u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+R^{n}  \tag{11}\\
R^{n} & =\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right) \tag{12}
\end{align*}
$$

## Leading-order error terms in finite differences (2)

$$
\begin{align*}
{\left[\bar{D}_{t} u\right]^{n+\theta} } & =\frac{u^{n+1}-u^{n}}{\Delta t}=u^{\prime}\left(t_{n+\theta}\right)+R^{n+\theta},  \tag{13}\\
R^{n+\theta} & =\frac{1}{2}(1-2 \theta) u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\theta}\right) \Delta t-\frac{1}{6}\left((1-\theta)^{3}-\theta^{3}\right) u^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\theta}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}(  \tag{14}\\
{\left[D_{t}^{2-} u\right]^{n} } & =\frac{3 u^{n}-4 u^{n-1}+u^{n-2}}{2 \Delta t}=u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+R^{n},  \tag{15}\\
R^{n} & =-\frac{1}{3} u^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{3}\right)  \tag{16}\\
{\left[D_{t} D_{t} u\right]^{n} } & =\frac{u^{n+1}-2 u^{n}+u^{n-1}}{\Delta t^{2}}=u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+R^{n},  \tag{17}\\
R^{n} & =\frac{1}{12} u^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right) \tag{18}
\end{align*}
$$

Weighted arithmetic mean:

$$
\begin{align*}
{\left[\bar{u}^{t, \theta}\right]^{n+\theta} } & =\theta u^{n+1}+(1-\theta) u^{n}=u\left(t_{n+\theta}\right)+R^{n+\theta}  \tag{19}\\
R^{n+\theta} & =\frac{1}{2} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\theta}\right) \Delta t^{2} \theta(1-\theta)+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{3}\right) \tag{20}
\end{align*}
$$

Standard arithmetic mean:

$$
\begin{align*}
{\left[\bar{u}^{t}\right]^{n} } & =\frac{1}{2}\left(u^{n-\frac{1}{2}}+u^{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)=u\left(t_{n}\right)+R^{n}  \tag{21}\\
R^{n} & =\frac{1}{8} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\frac{1}{384} u^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{4}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{6}\right) \tag{22}
\end{align*}
$$

## Leading-order error terms in mean values (2)

Geometric mean:

$$
\begin{align*}
{\left[{\overline{u^{2}}}^{t, g}\right]^{n} } & =u^{n-\frac{1}{2}} u^{n+\frac{1}{2}}=\left(u^{n}\right)^{2}+R^{n}  \tag{23}\\
R^{n} & =-\frac{1}{4} u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)^{2} \Delta t^{2}+\frac{1}{4} u\left(t_{n}\right) u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right) . \tag{24}
\end{align*}
$$

Harmonic mean:

$$
\begin{align*}
{\left[\bar{u}^{t, h}\right]^{n} } & =u^{n}=\frac{2}{\frac{1}{u^{n-\frac{1}{2}}}+\frac{1}{u^{n+\frac{1}{2}}}}+R^{n+\frac{1}{2}}  \tag{25}\\
R^{n} & =-\frac{u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)^{2}}{4 u\left(t_{n}\right)} \Delta t^{2}+\frac{1}{8} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2} . \tag{26}
\end{align*}
$$

- Can use sympy to automate calculations with Taylor series.
- Tool: course module truncation_errors

```
>>> from truncation_errors import TaylorSeries
>>> from sympy import *
>>> u, dt = symbols('u dt')
>>> u_Taylor = TaylorSeries(u, 4)
>>> u_Taylor(dt)
D1u*dt + D2u*dt**2/2 + D3u*dt**3/6 + D4u*dt**4/24 + u
>>> FE = (u_Taylor(dt) - u)/dt
>>> FE
(D1u*dt + D2u*dt**2/2 + D3u*dt**3/6 + D4u*dt**4/24)/dt
>>> simplify(FE)
D1u + D2u*dt/2 + D3u*dt**2/6 + D4u*dt**3/24
```

Notation: D1u for $u^{\prime}$, D2u for $u^{\prime \prime}$, etc.
See trunc/truncation_errors.py.

A class DiffOp represents many common difference operators:
>>> from truncation_errors import DiffOp
>>> from sympy import *
>>> u = Symbol('u')
>>> diffop = DiffOp(u, independent_variable='t')
>>> diffop['geometric_mean']
$-\mathrm{D} 1 \mathrm{u} * * 2 * \mathrm{dt} * * 2 / 4-\mathrm{D} 1 \mathrm{u} * \mathrm{D} 3 \mathrm{u} * \mathrm{dt} * * 4 / 48+\mathrm{D} 2 \mathrm{u} * * 2 * \mathrm{dt} * * 4 / 64+\ldots$
>>> diffop['Dtm']
$\mathrm{D} 1 \mathrm{u}+\mathrm{D} 2 \mathrm{u} * \mathrm{dt} / 2+\mathrm{D} 3 \mathrm{u} * \mathrm{dt} * * 2 / 6+\mathrm{D} 4 \mathrm{u} * \mathrm{dt} * * 3 / 24$
>>> diffop.operator_names()
['geometric_mean', 'harmonic_mean', 'Dtm', 'D2t', 'DtDt',
'weighted_arithmetic_mean', 'Dtp', 'Dt']
Names in diffop: Dtp for $D_{t}^{+}$, $\operatorname{Dtm}$ for $D_{t}^{-}, \mathrm{Dt}$ for $D_{t}, \mathrm{D} 2 \mathrm{t}$ for $D_{2 t}$, DtDt for $D_{t} D_{t}$.

Truncation errors in exponential decay ODE

$$
u^{\prime}(t)=-a u(t)
$$

The Forward Euler scheme:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t}^{+} u=-a u\right]^{n} . \tag{27}
\end{equation*}
$$

Definition of the truncation error $R^{n}$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t}^{+} u_{\mathrm{e}}+a u_{\mathrm{e}}=R\right]^{n} \tag{28}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (11)-(12):

$$
\left[D_{t}^{+} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n}=u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\frac{1}{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)
$$

Inserted in (28):

$$
u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\frac{1}{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)+a u_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n}\right)=R^{n}
$$

Note: $u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+a u_{\mathrm{e}}^{n}=0$ since $u_{\mathrm{e}}$ solves the ODE. Then

$$
\begin{equation*}
R^{n}=\frac{1}{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right) \tag{29}
\end{equation*}
$$

Crank-Nicolson:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t} u=-a u\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}} \tag{30}
\end{equation*}
$$

Truncation error:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}+a{\overline{u_{\mathrm{e}}}}^{t}=R\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}} \tag{31}
\end{equation*}
$$

From (5)-(6) and (21)-(22):

$$
\begin{aligned}
& {\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}}=u^{\prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)+\frac{1}{24} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)} \\
& {\left[a \bar{u}_{\mathrm{e}}^{t}\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}}=u\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)+\frac{1}{8} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}++\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)}
\end{aligned}
$$

Inserted in the scheme we get

$$
\begin{equation*}
R^{n+\frac{1}{2}}=\left(\frac{1}{24} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)+\frac{1}{8} u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right) \tag{32}
\end{equation*}
$$

$R^{n}=\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)$ (second-order scheme)

## Test the understanding!

Analyze the the truncation error of the Backward Euler scheme and show that it is $\mathcal{O}(\Delta t)$ (first order scheme).

The $\theta$-rule:

$$
\left[\bar{D}_{t} u=-a \bar{u}^{t, \theta}\right]^{n+\theta}
$$

Truncation error:

$$
\left[\bar{D}_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}+a \bar{u}_{\mathrm{e}}{ }^{t, \theta}=R\right]^{n+\theta}
$$

Use (13)-(14) and (19)-(20) along with $u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n+\theta}\right)+a u_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n+\theta}\right)=0$ to show

$$
\begin{align*}
R^{n+\theta}= & \left(\frac{1}{2}-\theta\right) u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\theta}\right) \Delta t+\frac{1}{2} \theta(1-\theta) u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\theta}\right) \Delta t^{2}+ \\
& \frac{1}{2}\left(\theta^{2}-\theta+3\right) u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\theta}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{3}\right) \tag{33}
\end{align*}
$$

Note: 2 nd-order scheme if and only if $\theta=1 / 2$.

## Using symbolic software

Can use sympy and the tools in truncation_errors.py:

```
def decay():
    u, a = sm.symbols('u a')
    diffop = DiffOp(u, independent_variable='t',
        num_terms_Taylor_series=3)
    D1u = diffop.D(1) # symbol for du/dt
    ODE = D1u + a*u # define ODE
    # Define schemes
    FE = diffop['Dtp'] + a*u
    CN = diffop['Dt' ] + a*u
    BE = diffop['Dtm'] + a*u
    # Residuals (truncation errors)
    R = {'FE': FE-ODE, 'BE': BE-ODE, 'CN': CN-ODE}
    return R
```

The returned dictionary becomes

```
decay: {
    'BE': D2u*dt/2 + D3u*dt**2/6,
    'FE': -D2u*dt/2 + D3u*dt**2/6,
    'CN': D3u*dt**2/24,
}
```

$\theta$-rule: see truncation_errors.py (long expression, very advantageous to automate the math!)

Ideas:

- Compute $R^{n}$ numerically
- Run a sequence of meshes
- Estimate the convergence rate of $R^{n}$

For the Forward Euler scheme:

$$
\begin{equation*}
R^{n}=\left[D_{t}^{+} u_{\mathrm{e}}+a u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n} . \tag{34}
\end{equation*}
$$

Insert correct $u_{\mathrm{e}}(t)=l e^{-a t}$ (or use method of manufactured solution in more general cases).

## Empirical verification of the truncation error (2)

- Assume $R^{n}=C \Delta t^{r}$
- $C$ and $r$ will vary with $n$-must estimate $r$ for each mesh point
- Use a sequence of meshes with $N_{t}=2^{-k} N_{0}$ intervals, $k=1,2, \ldots$
- Transform $R^{n}$ data to the coarsest mesh and estimate $r$ for each coarse mesh point

See the text for more details and an implementation.

## Empirical verification of the truncation error in the Forward Euler scheme



Eigurn: Ectimatad troungtion prror at moch nointe for difforont monhor

## Empirical verification of the truncation error in the Forward Euler scheme



Fioure Difference between theoretical and estimated truncation error at

## Increasing the accuracy by adding correction terms

## Question.

Can we add terms in the differential equation that can help increase the order of the truncation error?
To be precise for the Forward Euler scheme, can we find $C$ to make $R \mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)$ ?

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t}^{+} u_{\mathrm{e}}+a u_{\mathrm{e}}=C+R\right]^{n} \tag{35}
\end{equation*}
$$

$$
\frac{1}{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t-\frac{1}{6} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{3}\right)=C^{n}+R^{n}
$$

Choosing

$$
C^{n}=\frac{1}{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t
$$

makes

$$
R^{n}=\frac{1}{6} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{3}\right)
$$

## Lowering the order of the derivative in the correction term

- $C^{n}$ contains $u^{\prime \prime}$
- Can discretize $u^{\prime \prime}$ (requires $u^{n+1}, u^{n}$, and $u^{n-1}$ )
- Can also express $u^{\prime \prime}$ in terms of $u^{\prime}$ or $u$

$$
u^{\prime}=-a u, \quad \Rightarrow \quad u^{\prime \prime}=-a u^{\prime}=a^{2} u
$$

Result for $u^{\prime \prime}=a^{2} u$ : apply Forward Euler to a perturbed $O D E$,

$$
\begin{equation*}
u^{\prime}=-\hat{a} u, \quad \hat{a}=a\left(1-\frac{1}{2} a \Delta t\right) \tag{36}
\end{equation*}
$$

to make a second-order scheme!

## With a correction term Forward Euler becomes Crank-Nicolson

Use the other alternative $u^{\prime \prime}=-a u^{\prime}$ :

$$
u^{\prime}=-a u-\frac{1}{2} a \Delta t u^{\prime} \quad \Rightarrow \quad\left(1+\frac{1}{2} a \Delta t\right) u^{\prime}=-a u
$$

Apply Forward Euler:

$$
\left(1+\frac{1}{2} a \Delta t\right) \frac{u^{n+1}-u^{n}}{\Delta t}=-a u^{n}
$$

which after some algebra can be written as

$$
u^{n+1}=\frac{1-\frac{1}{2} a \Delta t}{1+\frac{1}{2} a \Delta t} u^{n}
$$

This is a Crank-Nicolson scheme (of second order)!

## Correction terms in the Crank-Nicolson scheme (1)

$$
\left[D_{t} u=-a \bar{u}^{t}\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}}
$$

Definition of the truncation error $R$ and correction terms $C$ :

$$
\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}+a{\overline{u_{\mathrm{e}}}}^{t}=C+R\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}} .
$$

Must Taylor expand

- the derivative
- the arithmetic mean

$$
C^{n+\frac{1}{2}}+R^{n+\frac{1}{2}}=\frac{1}{24} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\frac{a}{8} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right) .
$$

Let $C^{n+\frac{1}{2}}$ cancel the $\Delta t^{2}$ terms:

$$
C^{n+\frac{1}{2}}=\frac{1}{24} u_{e}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\frac{a}{8} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}
$$

## Correction terms in the Crank-Nicolson scheme (2)

- Must replace $u^{\prime \prime \prime}$ and $u^{\prime \prime}$ in correction term
- Using $u^{\prime}=-a u: u^{\prime \prime}=a^{2} u$ and $u^{\prime \prime \prime}=-a^{3} u$

Result: solve the perturbed ODE by a Crank-Nicolson method,

$$
u^{\prime}=-\hat{a} u, \quad \hat{a}=a\left(1-\frac{1}{12} a^{2} \Delta t^{2}\right) .
$$

and experience an error $\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)$.

## Extension to variable coefficients

$$
u^{\prime}(t)=-a(t) u(t)+b(t)
$$

Forward Euler:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t}^{+} u=-a u+b\right]^{n} \tag{37}
\end{equation*}
$$

The truncation error is found from

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t}^{+} u_{\mathrm{e}}+a u_{\mathrm{e}}-b=R\right]^{n} \tag{38}
\end{equation*}
$$

Using (11)-(12):

$$
u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)-\frac{1}{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)+a\left(t_{n}\right) u_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n}\right)-b\left(t_{n}\right)=R^{n} .
$$

Because of the ODE, $u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+a\left(t_{n}\right) u_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n}\right)-b\left(t_{n}\right)=0$, and

$$
\begin{equation*}
R^{n}=-\frac{1}{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right) \tag{39}
\end{equation*}
$$

No problems with variable coefficients!

How does the truncation error depend on $u_{\mathrm{e}}$ in finite differences?

- One-sided differences: $u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime} \Delta t$ (lowest order)
- Centered differences: $u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime} \Delta t^{2}$ (lowest order)
- Only harmonic and geometric mean involve $u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}$ or $u_{\mathrm{e}}$

Consequence:

- $u_{\mathrm{e}}(t)=c t+d$ will very often give exact solution of the discrete equations $(R=0)$ !
- Ideal for verification
- Centered schemes allow quadratic $u_{e}$

Problem: harmonic and geometric mean (error depends on $u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}$ and $u_{e}$ )

## Computing truncation errors in nonlinear problems (1)

$$
\begin{equation*}
u^{\prime}=f(u, t) \tag{40}
\end{equation*}
$$

Crank-Nicolson scheme:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t} u^{\prime}=\bar{f}^{t}\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}} . \tag{41}
\end{equation*}
$$

Truncation error:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}-\bar{f}^{t}=R\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}} . \tag{42}
\end{equation*}
$$

Using (21)-(22) for the arithmetic mean:

$$
\begin{aligned}
{\left[\bar{f}^{t}\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}} } & =\frac{1}{2}\left(f\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}^{n}, t_{n}\right)+f\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}^{n+1}, t_{n+1}\right)\right) \\
& =f\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}^{n+\frac{1}{2}}, t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)+\frac{1}{8} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Computing truncation errors in nonlinear problems (2)

With (5)-(6), (42) leads to $R^{n+\frac{1}{2}}$ equal to
$u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)+\frac{1}{24} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right) \Delta t^{2}-f\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}^{n+\frac{1}{2}}, t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)-\frac{1}{8} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)$.
Since $u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)-f\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}^{n+\frac{1}{2}}, t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)=0$, the truncation error becomes

$$
R^{n+\frac{1}{2}}=\left(\frac{1}{24} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)-\frac{1}{8} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)\right) \Delta t^{2} .
$$

The computational techniques worked well even for this nonlinear ODE!

## Truncation errors in vibration ODEs

$$
\begin{equation*}
u^{\prime \prime}(t)+\omega^{2} u(t)=0, \quad u(0)=I, \quad u^{\prime}(0)=0 . \tag{43}
\end{equation*}
$$

Centered difference approximation:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t} D_{t} u+\omega^{2} u=0\right]^{n} . \tag{44}
\end{equation*}
$$

Truncation error:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[D_{t} D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}+\omega^{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}=R\right]^{n} . \tag{45}
\end{equation*}
$$

Use (17)-(18) to expand $\left[D_{t} D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n}$ :

$$
\left[D_{t} D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n}=u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\frac{1}{12} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2},
$$

Collect terms: $u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}(t)+\omega^{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}(t)=0$. Then,

$$
\begin{equation*}
R^{n}=\frac{1}{12} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right) . \tag{46}
\end{equation*}
$$

## Truncation errors in the initial condition

- Initial conditions: $u(0)=I, u^{\prime}(0)=V$
- Need discretization of $u^{\prime}(0)$
- Standard, centered difference: $\left[D_{2 t} u=V\right]^{0}, R^{0}=\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)$
- Simpler, forward difference: $\left[D_{t}^{+} u=V\right]^{0}, R^{0}=\mathcal{O}(\Delta t)$
- Does the lower order of the forward scheme impact the order of the whole simulation?
- Answer: run experiments!


## Computing correction terms

- Can we add terms to the ODE such that the truncation error is improved?

$$
\left[D_{t} D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}+\omega^{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}=C+R\right]^{n}
$$

- Idea: choose $C^{n}$ such that it absorbs the $\Delta t^{2}$ term in $R^{n}$,

$$
C^{n}=\frac{1}{12} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}
$$

- Downside: got a $u^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}$ term
- Remedy: use the ODE $u^{\prime \prime}=-\omega^{2} u$ to see that $u^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}=\omega^{4} u$.
- Just apply the standard scheme to a modified ODE:

$$
\left[D_{t} D_{t} u+\omega^{2}\left(1-\frac{1}{12} \omega^{2} \Delta t^{2}\right) u=0\right]^{n}
$$

- Accuracy is $\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)$.


## Model with damping and nonlinearity

Linear damping $\beta u^{\prime}$, nonlinear spring force $s(u)$, and excitation $F$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
m u^{\prime \prime}+\beta u^{\prime}+s(u)=F(t) \tag{47}
\end{equation*}
$$

Central difference discretization:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[m D_{t} D_{t} u+\beta D_{2 t} u+s(u)=F\right]^{n} . \tag{48}
\end{equation*}
$$

Truncation error is defined by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[m D_{t} D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}+\beta D_{2 t} u_{\mathrm{e}}+s\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}\right)=F+R\right]^{n} \tag{49}
\end{equation*}
$$

## Carrying out the truncation error analysis

Using (17)-(18) and (7)-(8) we get

$$
\begin{aligned}
{\left[m D_{t} D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}+\beta D_{2 t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n}=} & m u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\beta u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+ \\
& \left(\frac{m}{12} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\frac{\beta}{6} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

The terms

$$
m u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\beta u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\omega^{2} u_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n}\right)+s\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n}\right)\right)-F^{n},
$$

correspond to the ODE (= zero).
Result: accuracy of $\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)$ since

$$
\begin{equation*}
R^{n}=\left(\frac{m}{12} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\frac{\beta}{6} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right), \tag{50}
\end{equation*}
$$

Correction terms: complicated when the ODE has many terms...

## Extension to quadratic damping

$$
\begin{equation*}
m u^{\prime \prime}+\beta\left|u^{\prime}\right| u^{\prime}+s(u)=F(t) . \tag{51}
\end{equation*}
$$

Centered scheme: $\left|u^{\prime}\right| u^{\prime}$ gives rise to a nonlinearity. Linearization trick: use a geometric mean,

$$
\left[\left|u^{\prime}\right| u^{\prime}\right]^{n} \approx\left|\left[u^{\prime}\right]^{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right|\left[u^{\prime}\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}} .
$$

Scheme:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[m D_{t} D_{t} u\right]^{n}+\beta\left|\left[D_{t} u\right]^{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right|\left[D_{t} u\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}}+s\left(u^{n}\right)=F^{n} . \tag{52}
\end{equation*}
$$

## The truncation error for quadratic damping (1)

Definition of $R^{n}$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left[m D_{t} D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n}+\beta\left|\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right|\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}}+s\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}^{n}\right)-F^{n}=R^{n} . \tag{53}
\end{equation*}
$$

Truncation error of the geometric mean, see (23)-(24),

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left|\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right|\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n+\frac{1}{2}}= & {\left[\left|D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right| D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n}-\frac{1}{4} u^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)^{2} \Delta t^{2}+} \\
& \frac{1}{4} u\left(t_{n}\right) u^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Using (5)-(6) for the $D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}$ factors results in

$$
\begin{aligned}
{\left[\left|D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right| D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n}=} & \left|u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}+\frac{1}{24} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)\right| \times \\
& \left(u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}+\frac{1}{24} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

For simplicity, remove the absolute value. The product becomes

$$
\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}} D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n}=\left(u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\right)^{2}+\frac{1}{12} u_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n}\right) u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)
$$

With

$$
m\left[D_{t} D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n}=m u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\frac{m}{12} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)
$$

and using $m u^{\prime \prime}+\beta\left(u^{\prime}\right)^{2}+s(u)=F$, we end up with

$$
R^{n}=\left(\frac{m}{12} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)+\frac{\beta}{12} u_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n}\right) u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n}\right)\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right) .
$$

Second-order accuracy! Thanks to

- difference approximation with error $\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)$
- geometric mean approximation with error $\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)$

$$
\begin{equation*}
m u^{\prime \prime}+\beta\left|u^{\prime}\right| u^{\prime}+s(u)=F(t) . \tag{54}
\end{equation*}
$$

Rewritten as first-order system:

$$
\begin{align*}
u^{\prime} & =v  \tag{55}\\
v^{\prime} & =\frac{1}{m}(F(t)-\beta|v| v-s(u)) \tag{56}
\end{align*}
$$

To solution methods:

- Forward-backward scheme
- Centered scheme on a staggered mesh

Forward step for $u$, backward step for $v$ :

$$
\begin{align*}
& {\left[D_{t}^{+} u=v\right]^{n}}  \tag{57}\\
& {\left[D_{t}^{-} v=\frac{1}{m}(F(t)-\beta|v| v-s(u))\right]^{n+1} .} \tag{58}
\end{align*}
$$

- Note:
- step $u$ forward with known $v$ in (57)
- step $v$ forward with known $u$ in (58)
- Problem: $|v| v$ gives nonlinearity $\left|v^{n+1}\right| v^{n+1}$.
- Remedy: linearized as $\left|v^{n}\right| v^{n+1}$

$$
\begin{align*}
{\left[D_{t}^{+} u\right.} & =v]^{n}  \tag{59}\\
{\left[D_{t}^{-} v\right]^{n+1} } & =\frac{1}{m}\left(F\left(t_{n+1}\right)-\beta\left|v^{n}\right| v^{n+1}-s\left(u^{n+1}\right)\right) \tag{60}
\end{align*}
$$

- Aim (as always): turn difference operators into derivatives + truncation error terms
- One-sided forward/backward differences: error $\mathcal{O}(\Delta t)$
- Linearization of $\left|v^{n+1}\right| v^{n+1}$ to $\left|v^{n}\right| v^{n+1}$ : error $\mathcal{O}(\Delta t)$
- All errors are $\mathcal{O}(\Delta t)$
- First-order scheme? No!
- "Symmetric" use of the $\mathcal{O}(\Delta t)$ building blocks yields in fact a $\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)$ scheme (!)
- Why? See next slide...


## A centered scheme on a staggered mesh

Staggered mesh:

- $u$ is computed at mesh points $t_{n}$
- $v$ is computed at points $t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}$

Centered differences in (55)-(55):

$$
\begin{align*}
& {\left[D_{t} u=v\right]^{n-\frac{1}{2}},}  \tag{61}\\
& {\left[D_{t} v=\frac{1}{m}(F(t)-\beta|v| v-s(u))\right]^{n} .} \tag{62}
\end{align*}
$$

- Problem: $\left|v^{n}\right| v^{n}$, because $v^{n}$ is not computed directly
- Remedy: Geometric mean,

$$
\left|v^{n}\right| v^{n} \approx\left|v^{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right| v^{n+\frac{1}{2}}
$$

## Truncation error analysis (1)

Resulting scheme:

$$
\begin{align*}
{\left[D_{t} u\right]^{n-\frac{1}{2}} } & =v^{n-\frac{1}{2}}  \tag{63}\\
{\left[D_{t} v\right]^{n} } & =\frac{1}{m}\left(F\left(t_{n}\right)-\beta\left|v^{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right| v^{n+\frac{1}{2}}-s\left(u^{n}\right)\right) \tag{64}
\end{align*}
$$

The truncation error in each equation is found from

$$
\begin{aligned}
{\left[D_{t} u_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n-\frac{1}{2}} } & =v_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right)+R_{u}^{n-\frac{1}{2}} \\
{\left[D_{t} v_{\mathrm{e}}\right]^{n} } & =\frac{1}{m}\left(F\left(t_{n}\right)-\beta\left|v_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right)\right| v_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n+\frac{1}{2}}\right)-s\left(u^{n}\right)\right)+R_{v}^{n}
\end{aligned}
$$

Using (5)-(6) for derivatives and (23)-(24) for the geometric mean:

$$
u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right)+\frac{1}{24} u_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime \prime \prime}\left(t_{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right) \Delta t^{2}+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{4}\right)=v_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n-\frac{1}{2}}\right)+R_{u}^{n-\frac{1}{2}}
$$

and

$$
v_{\mathrm{e}}^{\prime}\left(t_{n}\right)=\frac{1}{m}\left(F\left(t_{n}\right)-\beta\left|v_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n}\right)\right| v_{\mathrm{e}}\left(t_{n}\right)+\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)-s\left(u^{n}\right)\right)+R_{v}^{n}
$$

## Truncation error analysis (2)

Resulting truncation error is $\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)$ :

$$
R_{u}^{n-\frac{1}{2}}=\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right), \quad R_{v}^{n}=\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)
$$

Observation.
Comparing The schemes (63)-(64) and (59)-(60) are equivalent. Therefore, the forward/backward scheme with ad hoc linearization is also $\mathcal{O}\left(\Delta t^{2}\right)$ !

